

Title of Lesson: *Conflict in Alabama in the 1830s: Native Americans, Settlers, and Government*
(Suggested grade level: 10th Grade Advanced U.S. History to 1877)

This lesson was created as a part of the Alabama History Education Initiative, funded by a generous grant from the Malone Family Foundation in 2009.

Author Information: Mary Hubbard, Advanced Placement History Teacher, Retired,
Consultant for the Alabama History Education Initiative

Background Information:

The following links provide background information on the conflict of the Indian Removal Act of 1830 in Alabama:

- [Population Statistics of Indians in 1830](#) is a two-page document that estimates the numbers of Native Americans living in various states in 1830. It also contains some commentary.
- [Letter from Cherokee Chiefs to Gov. Clay](#) (1835), in which the chiefs tell the governor that they are not responsible for any current unrest. They say U.S. agents have slandered them and created whatever problems exist between Native Americans and the U.S. government.
- [President Jackson's Message to Congress on Indian Removal 1830](#), is a one-page document in which Jackson tries to justify removing Native Americans.
- [Governor Gayle's Letter \(1834\)](#): Gov. Gayle is appointing two unnamed men as agents to investigate recent charges against Indians in the state.
- [Governor Clay's Letter \(1836\)](#): a letter written from Gov. Clay to J.W.A. Sanford & Co., "Emigrating Agents" (business men who were in charge of removing Native Americans)
- [APPARTS Strategy](#), a list of prompts students can ask of any primary source and is an effective method of promoting primary source analysis.
- The [Encyclopedia of Alabama](#) offers an extensive selection of articles and multimedia resources dealing with almost all aspects of Alabama history, geography, culture, and natural environment. Under the heading Alabama history, there is a great deal of information about Native Americans, including a map of Cherokee lands in northern Alabama in the early 1800s.
- [PBS "Africans in America" Indian Removal educational material](#) contains a summary on Indian Removal in general between the years 1814 and 1858. The resource bank also includes several relevant primary documents.
- [Digital History](#) is an online textbook that provides a wealth of educational resources on American history, including primary sources, multimedia, learning modules, lesson plans, exhibits, and teacher guides. This particular page contains a summary of the history of Indian Removal.
- [Indian Affairs: Laws and Treaties](#) is a 1904 compilation of all government treaties with Native Americans. Oklahoma State University converted the text into digital form. Treaties are listed by year but can also be accessed by tribe name.

Overview of lesson:

This lesson is designed to be part of a history unit covering the expansion of the United States in the early 1800s. It focuses specifically on conflicts between settlers and Native Americans (in Alabama and the Southeast) and includes multiple primary documents, including two letters written by different Alabama governors. The material links to Andrew Jackson's presidency, the Indian Removal Act of 1830, and the concept of Manifest Destiny. Student activities include: reading and analyzing primary documents, discussing and questioning the significance of the material, and writing an analytical essay. Emphasis is on developing

students' critical thinking and writing skills, their ability to analyze a visual image, and their ability to explore material in depth.

Content Standards

[Alabama Course of Study: Social Studies](#) (Bulletin 2004, No. 18)

Grade 10: Content Standard 9

Summarize major legislation and court decisions from 1800 to 1861 that led to increasing sectionalism, including the Missouri Compromise of 1820, the Compromise of 1850, the Fugitive Slave Act, the Kansas-Nebraska Act, and the Dred Scott decision.

- Analyzing the Westward Expansion from 1803 to 1861 to determine its effects on sectionalism, including the Louisiana Purchase, Texas Annexation, and the Mexican Cession.
- Identifying causes leading to the Westward Expansion
Examples: quest for gold and opportunity for upward mobility

[National Standards for History, 1996](#)

Era 4, Standard 1: United States territorial expansion between 1801 and 1861, and how it affected relations with external powers and Native Americans.

National Center for History in the Schools, Contents of Historical Thinking

Standard 2: Historical Comprehension

A. Identify the author or historical source of a document or narrative and assess its credibility.

Standard 3: Historical Analysis and Interpretation

B. Consider multiple perspectives.

C. Analyze cause and effect relationships and multiple causation, including the importance of the individual, the influence of ideas.

D. Draw comparisons across eras and regions in order to define enduring issues.

E. Distinguish between unsupported expressions of opinion and informed hypotheses grounded in historical evidence.

F. Appreciate historical perspectives.

[National Curriculum Standards for Social Studies](#), (Bulletin 111, 2010)

Theme 5: Individuals, Groups, and Institutions

Primary Learning Objective(s):

After completing this lesson, the student should be able to:

- Identify and explain some of the types of conflicts between settlers and Native Americans in Alabama
- Evaluate the extent of those conflicts and the problems they presented to political leaders
- Compare and contrast the attitudes and actions taken by two Alabama governors
- Compare their actions and attitudes to Pres. Jackson's
- Appreciate the difficulties political leaders (governors and the president) faced when dealing with the conflicts between Native Americans and settlers
- Identify several points of view regarding removal of Native Americans
- Make connections between events in Alabama, the removal of Native Americans from this region, and Manifest Destiny
- Explore the cultural perceptions most American settlers had about Native Americans in the early 1800s and try to understand those perceptions within that time period, while not accepting them as valid in our own.

Additional Learning Objective(s):

- Students will understand how a solution to a problem can often contain problematic consequences of its own.

Time allotted: 130 minutes

Materials and Equipment:

- Copies of all primary sources (attached)
- Prompt for analyzing all primary sources (attached)
- Chart for comparing letters of two governors (attached)
- [Image of John Gast's painting "American Progress"](#) (attached)
- Essay prompt (attached)
- Rubric for evaluating essay (attached)

Technological Resources:

- Computer with internet connection
- Digital projector (if available)

Background/Preparation:

The student should know the following:

- This material focuses on the 1830s. Students should have some general background knowledge about: [Native American tribes in the Southeast](#), particularly in Alabama; the War of 1812 and the [massacre at Fort Mims](#); the loss of Creek land at the end of that [war](#); and the rapid increase in the number of settlers in this area, culminating in Alabama achieving [statehood in 1819](#). The [Encyclopedia of Alabama](#) is a good source for this background information.
- Three letters included in this lesson both come in two versions: handwritten and transcribed. Students will obviously need to work with the typed versions because the handwriting of each author is difficult to decipher. However, in terms of demonstrating some of the challenges historians face when working with primary sources, it would be worthwhile to show students at least one of the letters as it was originally written. (This is suggested in Step 5.)
- Number all the paragraphs in each typed letter before you Xerox any copies. This will make referencing particular portions of the documents during discussion much easier.
- The abbreviation in two letters' closings, "Obt. Svt." stands for "Obedient Servant."

Procedures/Activities:

Engagement/Motivation Activity:

- Put the following list of words/phrases on the board: spiritual, noble, primitive, peace-loving, savage, selfish, impulsive, communal, individualistic, immature, uncivilized, violent, generous, ethical, in tune with nature.
- Tell students to create a T-chart, with the headings: 1830 and 2010. Tell them to list the words/phrases under each of those dates that they think would most closely represent how white Americans thought (in 1830) and now think (in 2010) about Native Americans. When they have finished, go over the two lists.
- Pose these questions: "Why do you think so many white American settlers of the 18th and early 19th century thought of Native Americans in negative stereotypes? What are some factors that might help account for those attitudes? Why do we view them so differently today?" While students may have great difficulty accounting for the shift in attitude, list any reasonable responses on the board and discuss. At this point, it's more important that they notice the shift than that they be able to explain why it developed. Tell students that the material they'll be examining relates to conflicts between Native Americans and settlers in the 1830s (particularly in Alabama) and that it will touch on material reasons for disagreements as well as issues of prejudice.
- Provide the following 3 essential questions to students to use as a guide as they work through the lesson: "Why were conflicts between settlers and Native Americans in the 1830s, both in Alabama and the

nation as a whole, significant? What were some of the multiple reasons for these conflicts? What were the conflicts so difficult to resolve?”

Step 1	Distribute the document on Indian populations in 1830. Tell students to read the document individually and then write down 3-4 tentative conclusions (hypotheses) they might draw from this document. (Remind students not to simply restate specific facts; they must write down possible inferences and generalizations.) These conclusions can relate to the figures themselves or attitudes toward Native Americans that the unnamed authors seem to be expressing. Instruct students to annotate the document, underlining what they believe are relevant portions (or words they don't understand), and writing comments and questions on the side. Most importantly, tell them to think through how certain portions of the primary sources support their conclusions.
Step 2	When everyone has written down at least 2-3 conclusions, ask them to turn to someone sitting close by (2-3 others) and share their hypotheses. After several minutes, tell the groups to agree on three conclusions they believe are strongly supported by the document. (If you have access to a projector, display the document so that the whole class can see it as specific portions of it are referenced.) Ask each group to state one of their conclusions, identifying their textual support for it and explaining their reasoning. This would also be a good time for answering any questions they have about the document itself, including vocabulary.
Step 3	After every group has stated one of their conclusions and explained how the text supports it, open up the discussion by encouraging students to respond to each other's statements in a respectful but questioning manner. Which conclusions seem soundest? Why? Explore reasons for differences of opinion. Is there any general consensus among groups about which 3-4 are the soundest? Do some conclusions seem linked to this document but in a less clear-cut way? What other kinds of documents might be helpful in terms of confirming or challenging the conclusions this document suggests?
Step 4	Give students a copy of President Jackson's Message to Congress on the Indian Removal Act (see attached). Working in groups of 2-4, have them use the APPARTS strategy (see attached) to read and analyze the document. Using a whole-class discussion, go over their answers, encouraging questions as well as reasonable and respectful disagreement.
Step 5	Show students the handwritten copy of Governor Gayle's letter (preferably using a projector). This is the point where it would be appropriate to talk about how challenging it is for historians to work with handwritten documents. Distribute typed copies of Governor Gayle and Governor Clay's letters. Tell students to analyze these letters individually, using the APPARTS method (see attached). This could be homework.
Step 6	Assign students to small groups and ask them to complete the chart that compares and contrasts Gayle and Clay in terms of: 1) the situations they faced, 2) the actions they took, and 3) the attitudes they displayed. Ask groups to respond to each category and encourage discussion. Highlight the fact that both men were trying to deal with events as they unfolded locally, whereas President Jackson was more removed and concerned with "the bigger picture." If time permits, ask students to compare/contrast the two governors' overall approaches with Jackson's in terms of how they tried to resolve the conflicts between settlers and natives.

Step 7	Using their textbooks, have students determine the date of the Indian Removal Act. How does it compare with the dates on Jackson's message to Congress? To the two governor's letters? What do the different dates reveal?
Step 8	Hand out copies of the letter from Cherokee Chiefs to Governor Clay. Have a student read the transcribed portion at the bottom. Ask, "What additional information do we get from this document? How does it relate to the two Governor's letters?"
Step 9	Hand out (or display on projector) a copy of John Gast's painting, "American Progress." Even though it was created later (1872), ask students how it illustrates some of the same ideas and realities found in the previous documents. Tell them this illustration is considered emblematic of Manifest Destiny, a concept they they'll learn more about in subsequent lessons.
Step 10	Give out the essay prompt and go over the general instructions with students to make certain they understand the requirements. Distribute rubric.

Assessment Strategies:

1. Check APPARTS sheets for effort/completeness.
2. Give points for constructive participation in class discussions.
3. Grade essays using rubric.

The DBQ **APPARTS** Strategy

Use the APPARTS strategy to analyze documents correctly and use them appropriately.

Author: Who created the source? What do you know about the author? What is the author's point of view?

Place and time: Where and when was the source produced? How might this affect the meaning of the source?

Prior knowledge: Beyond information about the author, and the context of the document's creation, what do you know that would help you further understand the primary source? For example, do you recognize any symbols and recall what they represent?

Audience: For whom was the source created and how might this affect the reliability of the source?

Reason: Why was this source produced and how might this affect the reliability of the source?

The main idea: What point is the source trying to convey?

Significance: Why is this source important? Ask yourself, "So what?" in relation to the question asked.

ESSAY PROMPT

“Identify and explain 2-3 reasons political leaders concluded that the removal of Native Americans in the 1830s from what is now the Southeastern part of United States was the best solution to the long-standing conflict between natives and settlers. In your opinion, was the removal the only viable option? Why or why not?”

No matter how many paragraphs, every essay has three basic parts: introduction, body paragraph/s, and conclusion.

INTRODUCTION: You only have one chance to make a good first impression, so start strong. While no formula can guarantee success, there is one that can serve you well when writing historical essays. First of all, **DO NOT** think that a longer introduction is a better introduction. Below are the essential components. (Anything more may just be a distraction.)

- Begin with **one or two sentences of relevant historical context**. Avoid philosophizing or taking your question too far outside the time period. For the prompt I gave you this time, you could start with a sentence (at the most two) about the deeply-rooted nature of conflict between settlers and Native Americans. Include a **time frame**. (In this instance, you should indicate you’re mainly focusing on the 1830s.) Mentioning a time frame serves as a trajectory into the question and establishes, with solid chronological foundations, that you have control of the question.
- Include a reference to **place/region** (this prompt specifies the Southeastern U.S and more particularly Alabama.)
- **End** with a **clear thesis**. This must not be a statement of fact or simple restatement of the prompt. **It must offer an analytical thought**, one that gives your essay direction and provides something on which to hang the evidence. It’s a statement of the main arguments or points you will develop in your essay in response to the tasks assigned in the prompt. (It can be more than one sentence but keep it simple.)

BODY PARAGRAPH/S: This is where you flesh out your thesis. Although an introduction can provide direction and focus to your essay, the meat of what you say will be in the body paragraphs. As you write these, you should always have one eye on your thesis. Often, many students get caught up in telling a story or “data dumping,” which has no relation to the ultimate point of the essay. Essays are designed to test your *understanding*, not simply your ability to recall facts. Keep focused on connecting your evidence/examples to your thesis, at the same time avoiding tangential issues and concerns. Make certain you provide the following:

- **A strong topic sentence** that provides an analytical category for the paragraph. It cannot just restate a fact. It should give purpose and direction for the rest of the evidence you’ll discuss.
- **Support your conclusion with evidence**. When it comes to support, you must make selections. “More” is not necessarily better. Several well-chosen examples that are clearly and explicitly connected to the topic sentence, and ultimately, the thesis, are preferable to an unorganized or unexplained catalogue.
- **Explain** how your facts illustrate your overall conclusion. As you write, try to think of yourself as establishing connections between the examples (specifics) and the concept (abstract conclusion).
- **End** with a transition sentence which points the way to the next body paragraph (or the conclusion). Sentences like these take a reader systematically through an argument and show how each part fits with the others.

CONCLUSION: A conclusion doesn’t have to be long but it should tie the essay parts together by relating back to the original thesis (without using the exact same wording). It should answer the question “so what?” about the material and can make references to the long-lasting importance of the topic.

RUBRIC FOR ESSAY ON NATIVE AMERICAN AND SETTLERS

Category	Above Standard	Meets Standard	Approaches Standard	Below Standard	Score
Introduction	Provides context, time frame and reference to place. Offers a clear, comprehensive, and analytical thesis which appears at end of introduction.	May fail to mention one of the following: context, time frame, or reference to place. Offers a clear and analytical thesis in the appropriate place, but it may not touch on all parts of the prompt.	May fail to mention one or two of the following: context, time frame, or reference to place. Thesis lacks clarity, tends to be more a statement of fact than opinion, and/or doesn't touch on all parts of the prompt.	May fail to mention one or two of the following: context, time frame, or reference to place. Thesis is a restatement of prompt without offering an analytical opinion and/or may ignore parts of the prompt.	
Body Paragraphs	Each starts with a topic sentence that relates to the major thesis (doesn't just restate facts). All paragraphs contain substantive evidence that is clearly explained and meaningfully connected to the thesis.	One paragraph may be missing its analytical topic sentence. Adequate evidence is cited, but it could use more development and/or clearer connection to thesis.	One or more paragraph may be missing its analytical topic sentence. Paragraphs, although not well developed, still bear a loose connection to thesis. Supporting evidence may be thin.	One or more paragraphs may be missing its analytical topic sentence. Paragraphs offer little specific evidence and/or simply contain a list facts that isn't well explained.	
Conclusion	Doesn't repeat the thesis word-for-word but still link back to the major point/s. Answers the "so what?" question in a sophisticated way and wraps up the essay in a controlled fashion.	Doesn't repeat the thesis word-for-word and still links back to the major point/s. Attempts to answer the "so what?" question but may do so in a less than comprehensive or convincing way.	Makes some effort to rewrite the original thesis. While attempting the answer the "so what?" question, statement/s fall short of complete development so thoughts lack clarity and/or relevance.	Repeats the thesis almost word-for-word. No closure provided in terms of answering the "so what" questions (in a meaningful way)	